UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

ANDREA PAPPAGALLO,

Plaintiff,

-VS-

Case No. 20-cv-10422

Hon. Stephanie Dawkins Davis

TENNECO AUTOMOTIVE OPERATING COMPANY SEVERANCE BENEFIT PLAN, Effective as of July 20, 2018, TENNECO AUTOMOTIVE OPERATING COMPANY INC., and TENNECO INC., jointly and severally,

Defendants.

Barry S. Fagan (P34275)
Jennifer L. McManus (P65976)
FAGAN McManus, P.C.
Attorneys for Plaintiff
25892 Woodward Avenue
Royal Oak, MI 48067-0910
(248) 542-6300
bfagan@faganlawpc.com
jmcmanus@faganlawpc.com

Richard E. Nowak (IL 6302664)
Samuel D. Block (IL 6323648)
Samuel P. Myler (IL 6309755)
Mayer Brown LLP
Attorneys for Defendants
71 South Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606
(312) 701-8809
rnowak@mayerbrown.com
sblock@mayerbrown.com
smyler@mayerbrown.com

Michael G. Brady (P57331)
WARNER NORCROSS & JUDD LLP
Attorneys for Defendants
2000 Town Center, Suite 2700
Southfield, MI 48075-1318
(248) 784-5032
mbrady@wnj.com

<u>PLAINTIFF'S STATEMENT AS TO THE</u>
APPROPRIATE STANDARD OF REVIEW IN THIS CASE

Plaintiff, by and through his attorneys, FAGAN McMANUS, P.C., hereby submits Plaintiff's Statement as to the Appropriate Standard of Review in this Case as follows:

It is Plaintiff's position that the standard of review in this case is *de novo*. The basis for Plaintiff's position is that the Plan Administrator, identified as Defendant Tenneco Automotive Operating Company Inc. in the Tenneco Automotive Operating Company Inc, Severance Benefit Plan and Summary Plan Description (Effective as of July 20, 2018), did not make the decision regarding Plaintiff's claim for benefits or Plaintiff's appeal of the denial of his claim for benefits. Instead, Defendant Tenneco Inc. made the decision on both the claim and the appeal. In addition, an individual named Peter D. Acker signed the letters denying the claim and appeal on Defendant Tenneco Inc. letterhead. In the letter denying the appeal, Mr. Acker identified himself as the Plan Administrator.

When the benefits decision is made by a body other than the one authorized by the procedures set forth in the benefit plan, federal courts review the benefits decision *de novo*. Shelby County Health Care Corporation v. The Majestic Star Casino, LLC, 581 F.3d 355 (6th Cir. 2009)(holding that although the plan administrator was delegated discretionary authority to interpret the Plan, where the administrator failed to

exercise that discretion because it let someone else make the benefits determination, *de novo* review is appropriate); Sanford v. Harvard Industries, Inc., 262 F.3d 590 (6th Cir. 2001)(holding that where an unauthorized body that does not have fiduciary discretion to determine benefits eligibility renders such a decision, deferential review is not warranted and *de novo* review is appropriate).

FAGAN McManus, P.C.

By: Isl Barry S. Fagan

Barry S. Fagan (P34275)
Jennifer L. McManus (P65976)
Attorney for Plaintiff
25892 Woodward Avenue
Royal Oak, MI 48067-0910
(248) 542-6300
bfagan@faganlawpc.com
imcmanus@faganlawpc.com

Dated: July 2, 2020

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

ANDREA PAPPAGALLO,

Plaintiff,

-VS-

Case No. 20-cv-10422

Hon. Stephanie Dawkins Davis

TENNECO AUTOMOTIVE OPERATING COMPANY SEVERANCE BENEFIT PLAN, Effective as of July 20, 2018, TENNECO AUTOMOTIVE OPERATING COMPANY INC., and TENNECO INC., jointly and severally,

Defendants.

Barry S. Fagan (P34275)
Jennifer L. McManus (P65976)
FAGAN McManus, P.C.
Attorneys for Plaintiff
25892 Woodward Avenue
Royal Oak, MI 48067-0910
(248) 542-6300
bfagan@faganlawpc.com
jmcmanus@faganlawpc.com

Richard E. Nowak (IL 6302664)
Samuel D. Block (IL 6323648)
Samuel P. Myler (IL 6309755)
Mayer Brown LLP
Attorneys for Defendants
71 South Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606
(312) 701-8809
rnowak@mayerbrown.com
sblock@mayerbrown.com
smyler@mayerbrown.com

Michael G. Brady (P57331)
WARNER NORCROSS & JUDD LLP
Attorneys for Defendants
2000 Town Center, Suite 2700
Southfield, MI 48075-1318
(248) 784-5032
mbrady@wnj.com

PROOF OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on July 2, 2020, I electronically filed:

PLAINTIFF'S STATEMENT AS TO THE APPROPRIATE STANDARD OF REVIEW IN THIS CASE

with the Clerk of the Court using the ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the following:

- Michael G. Brady <u>mbrady@wnj.com</u>, <u>tlias@wnj.com</u>, tparrish@wnj.com
- Richard Nowak <u>rnowak@mayerbrown.com</u>, courtnotification@mayerbrown.com
- Samuel Block <u>sblock@mayerbrown.com</u>
- Samuel P Myler <u>smyler@mayerbrown.com</u>, <u>3708550420@filings.docketbird.com</u>, <u>courtnotification@mayerbrown.com</u>

and	I hereby	certify	that I	have	mailed	by	United	States	Postal	Service	the
pape	ers to the	followi	ng no	n-ECF	= partici	par	nts:				

(none)
---	------	---

Respectfully submitted, FAGAN MCMANUS, P.C.

By: Isl Barry S. Fagan

Barry S. Fagan (P34275)
Jennifer L. McManus (P65976)
Attorney for Plaintiff
25892 Woodward Avenue
Royal Oak, MI 48067-0910
(248) 542-6300
bfagan@faganlawpc.com
imcmanus@faganlawpc.com

Dated: July 2, 2020